
Request for Information

11-713

Parking System

Issued by: Tulsa Parking Authority

Issued On 10/25/2011
Responses Due 12/09/2011

Introduction

The Tulsa Parking Authority (TPA) is soliciting responses for this Request for Information (RFI) from interested parties willing to provide information pertaining to metered parking and its impact on its off-street garages in Tulsa. The Tulsa Parking Authority and the City of Tulsa (City) believe that the metered parking system is not optimized to promote economic development and to generate needed revenue for infrastructure improvements in the areas served by the metered and off street parking systems.

The TPA is seeking qualified vendors to submit strategies:

- To optimize the utilization of the metered parking system and the off-street parking garages;
- To improve the service quality and convenience experienced by users of the metered parking system;
- To maximize the parking system's impact on economic development;
- To generate additional revenues that could be used to fund capital improvements in the areas served by the metered parking system;
- To enhance the coordination of the TPA and City owned parking operations; and,
- To optimize the modernization, maintenance, and deployment of working parking meters.

Partial responses are welcome.

Information Response Submissions

Responses must be received by 4:00 p.m. on December 09, 2011, by:

David Giacomo
175 E 2nd St,
City Hall, 5th Floor
Tulsa, Oklahoma 74103
parkingsystem@cityoftulsa.org

Submissions can be mailed or emailed using the above information. If you choose to mail your RFI response, please include two copies.

Please note: It is solely the respondent's responsibility to ensure that the RFI response is received on time.

Overview of the Current System

1. Overview of Metered Parking System

1.1. Size of System- The City of Tulsa Metered Parking System (the System) consists of 1,461 metered spaces. See **Attachment 1** for map of meter placement. The meters and spaces are broken into the following types:

Meters	Metered Spaces	Meter Type	Credit/Coin	Time Limit	Location
66	338	Multi-Space	Credit and Coin	2 Hour	Downtown
57	382	Multi-Space	Coin	2 Hour	Downtown and 12 th Street
14	98	Multi-Space	Coin	2 Hour	Downtown (resources needed to install)
10	10	Single	Coin	1 Hour	Downtown
147	147	Single	Coin	10 Hour	Downtown
444	444	Single	Coin	2 Hour	Downtown
42	42	Single	Coin	2 Hour	15 th St: Peoria Ave to Utica Ave.
780	1,461				

1.2. Parking Districts - By ordinance, the metered spaces are broken into two districts: the Downtown Core Parking District (Core Parking District) and a district made up of everything outside the Core Parking District. The Core Parking District includes 1,402 of the total 1,461 metered spaces.

1.3. Operations - The City organizations that are involved in some aspect of Tulsa's System are as follows:

Function	Organization Responsible	Description	FTEs
Meter Installation and Maintenance	DPW	Change batteries, repair damaged meters, repair electronic multi-space meters, install new batteries	2
Meter Coin Collection	DPW	Collect revenue from the 131 multi-space and 643 single spaced meters	0 (same FTEs as above)
Meter Electronic Payment Software Collection	Duncan Solutions (Contractor)	Administered by Treasury-Finance	N/A

Enforcement	Working in Neighborhoods	Parking Investigator and Parking Inspector monitor meters and issue violations	2
Violation Collection	City Courts	Contracted to Linebarger, etc. (Currently being rebid.)	.2 (est.)

1.4. TPD Role - The Tulsa Police Department (TPD) also issues tickets for parking meter violations. Of the total meter violations written in 2010, TPD issued about 21%. Police involvement in issuing parking meter violations has varied anywhere from 18%- 36% of all parking meter violations issued annually over the past ten years. The percentage now generally hovers in the low to mid 20s.

2. Metered Parking System Asset and System Information

2.1. Meter Equipment- The System is made up of four different types of metered equipment.

Meters	Metered Spaces	Meter Type	Credit/Coin	Equipment
66	338	Multi-Space	Credit and Coin	Duncan Solutions VM Pay-by-Space Multi-Space Meter (see attachment 5 for more detail)
71 (14 not installed)	480 (98 not installed)	Multi-Space	Coin	Duncan Solutions VM Pay-by-Space Multi-Space Meter (see attachment 5 for more detail)
2	2	Single	Coin	Duncan Solutions electronic meters
500 ±	500 ±	Single	Coin	POM electronic meters (see attachment 6 for more detail)
138±	138±	Single	Coin	POM Park-o-meter

2.2. Equipment Status - The 123 installed multi-space meters (720 spaces) are in good shape. Of the 643 single spaced meters, it is estimated that only 20% of meters are operating efficiently. Many of the metered spaces do not actually have meters present.

2.3. Capital Investment and Operating Equipment Expenses - Since 2002, about \$300,000 has been spent on supplies and equipment for the System. The Streets and Storm Water Department that oversees the parking meter operation estimates the capital investment needed to bring the System up to optimal condition to be \$600,000. Another estimated \$100,000 is needed on an annual basis to keep the System, once updated, in optimal condition. This includes pavement markings for the multi-space meters, batteries, software upgrades, etc.

2.4. Current Rates - City of Tulsa ordinance establishes meter rates as follows:

Core Parking District

All 30-minute meters	\$ 0.10 each 1/2 hour
All 2-hour meters	\$ 0.25 each 1/2 hour
All 10-hour meters	\$ 0.05 each 1/2 hour

Outside the Core Parking District

All 30-minute meters	\$ 0.10 each 1/2 hour
All 1-hour meters	\$ 0.10 each 1/2 hour
All 2-hour meters	\$ 0.10 each 1/2 hour
All 10-hour meters	\$ 0.05 each 1/2 hour

2.5. Current Violation Rates - City of Tulsa ordinance establishes violation rates as follows:

STOPPING, STANDING AND PARKING

Meter Parking (Overtime)	\$15
Improper Parking at Meter	\$15
Unlawful Meter Deposits	COURT
Tampering with Meter	COURT
Parking Prohibited by Signs	\$30
Parking Prohibited – Certain Posted Hours	\$30
Parking Prohibited – Certain Times	\$30
Parallel Spaces at Meter	\$15
Diagonal Spaces at Meter	\$15

A \$10.00 late fee is assessed to the “Meter Parking (Overtime)” and the “Improper Parking at Meter” violations if they are not paid within 10 days.

2.6. Current Hours - City of Tulsa Ordinance establishes the hours of parking meter operation as between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m., except on Saturdays, Sundays, and legal holidays. City of Tulsa Ordinances pertaining to parking meters can be found in Titles 29 and 37 of the Tulsa Municipal Code.

3. Metered Parking System Financial Information

3.1. Meter Collections

3.1.1. Tulsa’s meter revenue from the System has decreased over the past 10 years. See the annual meter revenue data detail provided in **Attachment 2**.

3.1.2. According to various City leaders, the substantial decline in parking meter revenue can be attributed to several major components:

- Broken equipment;
- Reduction in meters;
- Lack of enforcement;
- Reallocation of police resources; and,
- Vandalism of meters

3.2 Violation Collections

3.2.1 The number of violations issued has declined steadily from 2001-2010. See **Attachment 2** for the year-by-year detail. There was a 39% decline in the number of parking violations issued in 2010 vs. 2001. The amount of possible revenue from the violations has decreased about 14% over the decade.

3.2.2 Violations are collected via a contract with Linebarger, Gigger, Blair and Sampson. Approximately 73% of the tickets written are collected on, which is comparable to industry standards. Approximately 86% of total violation-related revenues are collected. The collections rate has been fairly consistent over the last decade, with a slight improvement appearing when the Linebarger contract was executed in 2007.

3.3 EBITDA - As presented in **Attachment 2**, the City's EBITDA (net revenue) from the System has decreased by \$100k annually over the last 10 years and by more than \$150K from its peak.

4. 2008 Walker Parking Study and 2009 Parking Study

4.1. Background on Parking Studies - The Tulsa Parking Authority (TPA) commissioned several parking studies of downtown parking between 1999 and 2008. The 2008 study by Walker Parking concluded that Tulsa's metered rates, like those of many other cities, were set according to perceived economic thresholds in the community, rather than on the basis of value. A basis for value system would establish rates for on-street metered parking that are higher than off-street parking garages, pushing more motorists to use off-street parking garages and resulting in convenient and positive parking conditions downtown. Walker Parking recommended that TPA work with the City of Tulsa to establish a basis for value rate system to build a healthy downtown parking system. See the 2008 Walker Parking Study included as **Attachment 3**.

4.2. 2009 Analysis - An analysis of metered parking performed in 2009 provided an assessment of current performance vs. an industry based estimate of performance. The analysis determined that Tulsa's metered parking system was operating at an 8.89% occupancy rate based on the amount paid divided by operational time in a day. The 2009 analysis identified and documented several contributing factors to the low occupancy rate, including:

- Bagged and broken meters;
- City vehicles parking in prime parking spots for the full day;
- Unmarked and unmetered stalls;
- Poor space markings and signage; and,
- Signs marking a metered space but no meter installed.

5. Tulsa Parking Authority

5.1. TPA Background - The Tulsa Parking Authority was established for the benefit of the City of Tulsa under Title 60, Oklahoma Statutes, 1964, Sections 176 – 180, the Oklahoma Trust Act, with the City accepting the terms of the Trust Indenture under Title

39, Chapter 5. The purpose of TPA is to promote acquisition, construction and operation of parking facilities within the City of Tulsa. TPA has the financial capacity to issue revenue bonds to provide funds for the acquisition, construction and renovation of publicly operated parking facilities. TPA establishes annual budgets and rates and submits them to the City Clerk and Bond Trustee.

5.2. TPA Governance - TPA is governed by a Board of Trustees. The five member Board consists of one Mayoral designee, who is a full time city employee, and four trustees each serving six year terms. All members of the Board are appointed by the Mayor and approved by the Council. TPA has constructed or reconstructed five parking facilities: 1973 Main Park Plaza (1,161 spaces), 1976 Williams North and South (905 & 730 spaces), 1981 Civic Center Parkade (1,425 spaces) and 2004 100 West (1,191). In 2007, Williams Co's. legally assigned the North and South Garages to TPA. TPA contracts with two operators to provide parking management services to the garages - American Auto Parks and Central Parking System. TPA's gross revenues are around \$5.8 million annually, with \$5.6 million of this amount used to pay the operating cost, repairs and outstanding debt issued to build the garages. See the TPA FY12 Budget included as **Attachment 4**.

5.3 TPA Meter Information - In addition to the operation of five parking garages, TPA is responsible for the operation of 125 metered spaces located around the Old City Hall premises near the Tulsa Convention Center and the BOK Center. These 125 spaces are not included in the 1,461 City On-Street Metered System. TPA contracts out to operate and maintain the metered system. TPA plans to add an additional 50 to 75 metered spaces this fiscal year.

5.3.1 The TPA meters and spaces are broken into the following types:

Meters	Metered Spaces	Meter Type	Credit/Coin	Time Limit	Location
125	125	Single	Coin (able to take credit)	2 Hour	Old City Hall Area- 4 th Street and S. Denver Ave. W.
125	125				

5.3.2 TPA Meter Rates -

2 Hour Limit	\$0.50 per hour
--------------	-----------------

5.3.3 Equipment -

- Meters- Duncan Eagle CK Mechanism- 09/2010
- Housing- Duncan Model 76 Housings- 09/2010

RFI Response Content

TPA is open to all ideas for improving the functioning of the metered parking system and the off-street parking garages, including, but not limited to, re-evaluated parking meter placement

and multiple districts of operation, market rate pricing, changes in hours of operation, contracted services, technology utilization, modern meter systems, and capital financing options. TPA is interested in understanding how improvements to these components would improve the health of the metered parking system and the effect that a healthy metered parking system would have on the off-street parking garages and the general economic development of the City.

TPA is especially interested in those ideas that are based on best practices that have been demonstrated in other municipalities. Specific areas that TPA would like to see addressed in the RFI response are as follows:

1. Creative solutions to improve the maintenance and deployment of working parking meters, to include strategies to provide parking meter maintenance, repair, and installation services more efficiently and effectively.
2. Creative solutions to provide enforcement and collections more efficiently and effectively.
3. Ideas on equipment improvements, modifications, and technology investments that improve efficiencies, including funding mechanisms.
4. Creative compensation models under which a Contractor would provide such services and/or equipment.
5. Input on current rate structures, districts, and hours of operation to maximize utilization of the metered parking system and how proposed changes would affect economic development in the metered areas as well as City revenue streams. Input should include ideas on how the system can best meet the needs of businesses, downtown dwellers, hotel valet parking zones, residential programs and event parking.
6. Estimates regarding the effect of improvements to the metered parking system on TPA garage operations and revenues.
7. Address the proposed structure of the relationship between the Contractor and the contracting agency, during implementation, throughout the contract, and as relating to future business opportunities.
8. Provide detail on the information and data that would be necessary or helpful to include in an RFP procuring the type of parking-related services envisioned by the response to questions 1-7.

RFI Submission

The overall goal of this RFI is to solicit ideas and information that will enable the TPA and City to:

- To optimize the utilization of the metered parking system and the off-street parking garages;
- To improve the service, quality and convenience experienced by users of the metered parking system;
- To maximize the parking system's impact on economic development;
- To generate additional revenues that could be used to fund capital improvements in the areas served by the metered parking system;
- To enhance the coordination of TPA and City owned parking operations; and,

- To optimize the modernization, maintenance, and deployment of working parking meters.

Beyond responses to the questions listed in the previous section, other pertinent information provided by interested respondents will also be considered.

RFI response formats are at the discretion of the respondent, but should be concise (respondents are encouraged to limit their response to 25 pages) and contain the following:

- Introduction of the firm presenting the RFI response, including contact personnel and specific experience with related services.
- Summary of the ideas presented in the RFI Response.
- Specific responses to the items listed in the “RFI Response Content” section of the RFI document.
- Specific examples of work with other municipalities.
- Any additional information relevant to the subject matter of this RFI.

In addition to any specific responses your organization provides, you may also provide examples of bid invitations (or requests for proposal), contracts, terms and conditions, or other documents that address the topic. Include the names and locations of facilities where such bid-related documents have been used.

Special Terms & Conditions

1. All material submitted as part of the response to this Request for Information will be considered the property of the TPA.
2. The respondent will not be compensated for any expenses incurred in the process of responding to the RFI or, if requested, in submitting further information.
3. TPA makes no guarantees as to how the information provided by respondents will be used, and does not commit to any resulting procurement process.

Timeline

RFI Issued: 10/25/2011

Deadline for Written Questions: 11/09/2011

Target Date for City Responses to Written Questions: 11/18/2011

RFI Responses Due: 12/09/2011

Project Manager:

David Giacomo

175 E 2nd St, 5th Floor

Tulsa, OK 74103

parkingsystem@cityoftulsa.org